

# **How the EBRD loan for the Bishkek Public Transport Project in Kyrgyz Republic was wasted**

Bishkek Public Transport Project of the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD). Project number: 41492

<https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/bishkek-public-transport-project.html>

EBRD Bishkek Public Transport project: about 130 trolleybuses were purchased, but Bishkek citizens cannot use them, since on 8 November 2024 they were fully stopped by the Bishkek Trolleybus Company.

## **Project cost:**

2011: 16.0 million US dollars, including relevant technical cooperation funds.

2015 extension: 8.4 million US dollars, including relevant technical cooperation funds.

The project's objective was to improve the efficiency and quality of local services, improve environmental and social conditions associated with the renewal of the city's trolleybus fleet, the restoration of the trolleybus power supply system and the supply of key maintenance equipment. The loan also prioritized the improvement of conditions for female trolleybus depot workers.

Trolleybus purchase and deliveries:

2013: 79 trolleybuses

2018: 52 trolleybuses

**The official reason for dismantling of the trolleybus system and transfer of assets: the Osh City Hall asked for support - to bring 100 trolleybuses from Bishkek to Osh.**

**In violation of regulations, the Bishkek City Kenesh adopted resolutions to give away 100 Bishkek trolleybuses for free.**

It is important that there is no written agreement with the Bank that issued the loan. In their letter from 24 June 2024 (№5533) to the Mayor of Bishkek, EBRD representatives informed that "EBRD financing is for trolleybuses operating in Bishkek" and "require EBRD's consent to any transfer, lease or other disposition of all or a substantial portion of the assets operated by the project subject". At the meeting with residents, the EBRD Regional Head for the Kyrgyz Republic, Tajikistan and Turkmenistan, Ayten Rustamova, and other EBRD representatives responded that to date there have been no requests from the Kyrgyz Republic to renegotiate the loan agreement.

We, as an expert community, environmentalists, residents, and citizens of the Kyrgyz Republic ASK FOR THE PRESERVATION OF THE TROLLEYBUS AND PROVIDE SUPPORT TO DO ASSESSMENT OF THE EBRD LOAN WITH ALL THIS INFORMATION. Our trolleybus system has turned 74 years old since its foundation on January 13, 1951. It was a gift to our city in honor of the Anniversary of the Kara-Kyrgyz Republic.

Bishkek as the capital city of Kyrgyzstan joined EBRD Green Cities in 2019 with the aim of addressing their environmental issues and improving the quality of life of their residents, but not we do not have result, even opposite.

## TIMELINE

**Spring 2024** - Due to road construction, seven out of ten trolleybus routes were “temporarily” closed. The system consists of 210 km of overhead wires and 183 trolleybuses.

May 2024 - meeting with EBRD representatives in at the bank’s annual meeting and business forum in Yerevan. The issue was raised and papers with the intentions of local officials were transferred.

**6 June 2024** - Bishkek City Hall requested the Bishkek City Council (BCC) to give consent to the gratuitous alienation of 100 Bishkek trolleybuses to another city Osh - A draft of the resolution was published to start the Public Hearings.

Osh has two EBRD projects for electric transport and no need for extra fleets because it has only 2 trolley lines for this moment.

2024 - GrCF2 W2 - Osh Electric Public Transport. Project number: 53522

<https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/53522.html>

2014 - Osh Public Transport Project. Project number: 44243

<https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/osh-public-transport-project.html>

Osh requested 100 trolleybuses <https://cbd.minjust.gov.kg/7-31046/edition/14596/kg>

8 June 2024 - Public protest in trolleybus organized by citizens “Kiyinki Ayaldama”  
[https://bishkekismog.info/2024/07/01/kiyinki\\_ayaldama/](https://bishkekismog.info/2024/07/01/kiyinki_ayaldama/)

19 June 2024 - First cuts of the trolleybus wires on Abdrakhmanova Street. That day workers were stopped by citizens. It was started even before the end of public hearings (officially it was until 6 July 2024).

20 June 2024 - Due to the public protests all demolition works were shifted to the night time. Cuts continued without any legal permissions.

**24 June 2024** - The European Bank for Reconstruction and Development sent a letter to the Bishkek Mayor's Office stating that since this is a loan (\$23.5 million) for Bishkek trolleybuses, and all trolleybuses were to be destined for Bishkek only, they cannot be transferred elsewhere without the EBRD's written consent (attached below)

30 June 2024 - 3 routes and 50 vehicles remained in operation, and less than 1 km of overhead wires were demolished.

2 July 2024 - Exhibition “Trolleybus, I love you” by urban initiative Peshcom were obstructed by police <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=zhpRollQsqg>

**3 July 2024** - Protest by citizens to save the trolleybus system in Bishkek. Threats and limitations by police. [https://bishkekismog.info/2024/07/04/trebuem\\_trolleybus/](https://bishkekismog.info/2024/07/04/trebuem_trolleybus/)

**3 July 2024** - The BCC Permanent Committee on Municipal Property did not approve the draft resolution on two observations: 1) there were about 300 appeals from citizens stating that they were against 100 trolleybuses taken away from Bishkek. 2) according to the vice-mayor speech - the transfer of the trolleybuses requires the consent of the EBRD bank that issued the loan for the purchase of the trolleybuses. Also from the letter by regional management of the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development, the citizens had a confirmation that the Bishkek Mayor's Office did not apply for a revision of the contract and the city hall needs permission to give trolleybuses away. The loan totaling \$23.5 million (including grant aid) was for the purchase of new trolleybuses, modernization of the contact network, and the preparation of a \$450,000 worth public transport development document (which has now been removed from the website and is not available). The grant has the status of a law, it was passed at the level of the National Parliament and is regulated by national and international legislation. The law on the loan agreement for the purchase of

trolleybuses No. 1191-VI (dated December 21, 2016) says that the EBRD's permission is required [https://24.kg/obschestvo/304428\\_aktivisti\\_vbishkeke\\_potrebovali\\_ostanovit\\_otpravku\\_100\\_trolley\\_busov\\_vgorodosh/](https://24.kg/obschestvo/304428_aktivisti_vbishkeke_potrebovali_ostanovit_otpravku_100_trolley_busov_vgorodosh/)

6 July 2024 - the official end of public hearings. According to the official statements, more than 300 responses were received in opposition to the idea of discontinuation of the trolleybus system and were against giving consent to the gratuitous alienation.

9 July 2024 - The letter to the President of KR with request to stop trolleybus liquidation [https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/07/09/obraschenie\\_prezidentu/](https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/07/09/obraschenie_prezidentu/)

14 July 2024 - Public protest in trolleybus "Trolleybus excursion" by citizens <https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/07/10/excursia/>

**24 July 2024** - The BCC Permanent Committee on Property, transportation, budget and legal issues held a closed session, the recording of which is not available on the official channel of the BCC. The clearance for discontinuation was approved by 5 votes out of 45 deputies.

31 July 2024 - 2 routes and 30 vehicles remained in operation, and roughly 2 km of overhead wires were demolished.

8 August 2024 - online meeting with EBRD representatives. According to their statements, they do not have a "full picture" and have to scrutinize the issue further. Mr. Vitaly Kuznetsov, Ms. Ayten Rustamova, Ms. Olena Koval, and other EBRD representatives were present.

28 August 2024 - Press conference with citizens, human rights activists, and lawyers <https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/08/28/sud-2/>

**28 August 2024** - The BCC Permanent Committee on Property, transportation, budget, and legal issues held another closed session, the recording of which is not available on the official channel of the BCC. They rewrote the resolution, excluded the necessity of the Financial committee, and did not mention the loan agreed to give it further for the session voting.

**29 August 2024** - Resolution No. 152 On giving consent to the gratuitous alienation of passenger trolleybuses into state ownership of the Kyrgyz Republic was accepted by Bishkek City Council with many violations of National law and Loan agreement. (Published 09/05/2024)

<https://www.gorkenesh.kg/ru/the-rulings-of-the-bgk-mob/28-sozyv/5896-152-on-giving-consent-to-the-gratuitous-alienation-of-passenger-trolleybuses-into-the-state-ownership-of-the-kyrgyz-republic.html> This day citizens who came for the "open session" of BCC were not allowed to enter the venue. Two citizens were arrested <https://www.facebook.com/watch/?v=897805715570871>

30 August 2024 - 3 routes and 50 vehicles remain in operation, and roughly 3 km of overhead wires demolished. No significant changes happened till November.

4 September 2024 - the second request to EBRD on data provision about the Bishkek Public Transport Project.

6 September 2024 - The protest by citizens against giving away trolleybuses and the trolleybus system liquidation [https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/09/04/transport\\_kurultai/](https://bishkeksmog.info/2024/09/04/transport_kurultai/)

5-8 September 2024 - 6-20 trolleybuses were delivered to Osh (without documents signed by the Cabinet of Ministers KR and EBRD consent).

**4 November 2024** - the trolleybus service was closed, roughly 4 km of overhead wires demolished. Now there is a depot reconstruction in two trolleybuses depots to reconstruct them and to install the Asian Development Bank e-buses. It also violates the loan agreement with EBRD that says that no duplication of fundings should be introduced. Kyrgyz Republic : Urban Transport Electrification Project, Sovereign Project | 54123-001 <https://www.adb.org/projects/54123-001/main>

23 October 2024 - Lawsuit against the Bishkek City Council. Legal proceedings have begun regarding the transfer of trolleybuses - residents have filed a lawsuit to have the decision to transfer 100 trolleybuses declared illegal <https://bishkekismog.info/2024/10/08/sud-3/>

22 November 2024 - Lawsuit against the city hall. The court issued the suspension of network demolition till the end of the hearings. The next hearing is scheduled on 8.12.

24 November 2024 - Director of Trolleybus company managing workers to dismantle trolleybus network at Manas Venue that was recently renovated thanks to EBRD loan. He made himself publication about it <https://www.facebook.com/share/p/1GFU32npFs/>

25 November 2024 - workers were forced to continue the demolition during the night shifts.

8 December 2024 - The Administrative court approved city hall's activities on the demolition of trolleybus network as legal (on one street, other were ignored). An appeal was issued.

10 December 2024 - The trolleybuses transferred to Osh have been idle on the outskirts of the city and stand there for almost half a year. This is evidenced by the footage of Facebook user Gulmira Tynalieva. She found the capital's trolleybuses at the base of the subsidiary company of "Kyrgyzindustria" - "Kyrgyzchettrans-Osh".

<https://www.facebook.com/watch/?v=1393307874977780>

[https://24.kg/obschestvo/319441\\_skolko\\_esche\\_prostoyat\\_peredannyye\\_vregionyi\\_trolleibusyi\\_ipri\\_chem\\_tut\\_ebrd/](https://24.kg/obschestvo/319441_skolko_esche_prostoyat_peredannyye_vregionyi_trolleibusyi_ipri_chem_tut_ebrd/)

**12 December 2024 - illegal termination of working contracts for 21 employees of trolleybus company. The rest do not have any income starting either since the summer or since November 2024.**

As of the end of January, more than 20 km of overhead wires are demolished and the trolleybus fleet is stored.

6 January 2025 - Presentation at the Tuesday group meeting with US governors organized by the Bank Information Center.

17 January 2025 - Presentation in the National parliament on the issue of 3 loans for ecological transportation for Bishkek <https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=hVxwdY9RSEw>

05 February 2025 - Bishkek takes the first place in the world with the dirtiest air. The air in the capital of Kyrgyzstan with PM2.5 concentrations was 37 times higher than the WHO's recommended annual average for PM2.5.

[https://kaktus.media/doc/517453\\_bishkek\\_vnov\\_zanial\\_pervoe\\_mesto\\_po\\_yrovnu\\_zagrizneniia\\_vozdyha\\_v\\_mire.html](https://kaktus.media/doc/517453_bishkek_vnov_zanial_pervoe_mesto_po_yrovnu_zagrizneniia_vozdyha_v_mire.html)

07 February 2025 - Citizens have found Bishkek trolleybuses abandoned at one storage - around 50-60 new EBRD trolleybuses. [https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YGFnj2R\\_738](https://www.youtube.com/watch?v=YGFnj2R_738)

## **Detailed information on how was it happened**

### **Public Hearing and Stakeholders Participation**

- Public hearings were held until July 6, 2024, but the dismantling of the network began before their completion on June 19, 2024.
- As part of the public hearings, about 300 appeals were received from residents AGAINST the transfer of trolleybuses.
- At the trial, BCC did not present the minutes of the BCC meetings of July 26 and August 28, 2024, the court imposed a fine on BCC, and was also obliged to provide video protocols by January 22 for the court hearing.

Violation of the regulations of the constitutional body of BBC - lack of minutes with a positive conclusion of the standing specialized commissions. Lack of positive conclusions of the specialized commissions. When reviewed by the relevant committees, the draft resolution was rejected in June by the Standing Committee on Housing and Public Utilities and Transport - they refused to sign a positive conclusion. On July 3, 2024, the Standing Committee on Municipal Property (PC on UMS, land issues, urban planning and architecture) rejected the draft resolution, saying that residents were against it and there was no consent from the creditor bank - the EBRD. Deputies of the Standing Committee on Municipal Property signed a positive conclusion on July 24, but on August 28, 2024, they canceled this positive conclusion. There are no mandatory video protocols of the last two meetings.

There is no EBRD permission. According to the loan agreement ratified by the Housing and Public Utilities Committee, there should have been consent from the creditor bank for the transfer of trolleybuses, but at the time of approval at the open session of the Bishkek City Council, there was no consent from the bank at the time of signing the Cabinet of Ministers resolution "On the issues of transferring trolleybuses" in December.

### **Access to information and decision-making process**

Requests for access to information from the Bishkek City Hall are answered with the same text in almost all replies. It is not clear why EBRD trolleybuses and all systems of eco-transportation should be changed to electric buses. According to technical documents by the Asian Development Bank trolleybuses and e-buses should be working together. We still did not have answer from EBRD starting from last year about technical documents with this project.

According to B.Borubaeva, signatures of about 1500 people in support of preserving trolleybuses were collected and a petition was created, which also 1500 supported.

### **Access to justice**

Appeals to the City and General Prosecutor's Offices regarding the dismantling of the trolleybus lines before the Draft Resolution was approved and without the relevant documents were answered with replies that the City Hall can do the necessary work to improve the efficiency of transportation, which in this case is ineffective.

### **Denial of participation in the open session of Bishkek City Kenesh and detention of citizens**

On July 29, 2024, an open session of the Bishkek City Kenesh (BCC) was held in the akimiat of Oktyabrsky District, to which citizens were not allowed to attend. Among other issues at the session of the BHC, the draft resolution "On giving consent to the gratuitous alienation of passenger trolleybuses into the state ownership of the Kyrgyz Republic" was considered and approved without the prior consent of the creditor bank and the conclusion of the Standing Committee on Budget in violation of the current regulation on the BHC. Financing for trolleybuses operating in Bishkek was provided by the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development in two tranches totaling \$23.5 million.

### **Illegal detention**

There are no grounds for detention of activists at all. One can only be detained for 3 hours for identification, and they did not ask for a passport. When detained, you have the right to call your

relatives, you need them to find him + you can say that you will not talk without a lawyer and wait for 3 hours, more than three hours in no way can not detain you. After 3 hours, they have to issue an official protocol of detention, and this is another level of responsibility and there must be legal grounds for it. According to the law, they have no right to detain you for more than three hours. And in general, they can bring you to the station like this if you do not present your documents at a legal request and resist.

Exactly, they first have to present themselves, name, position and place of work, then present the charge, what exactly they are accused of, then ask for documents and draw up a protocol on administrative offense on the spot.

That is, it is the same article as driving through a red traffic light, we do not pull all drivers out of the car like that and do not drag them anywhere. They're outlaws if they just come up on the street, then yes, there should be an orientation or an official raid, but if in front of their eyes there was an offense in their opinion and accusation, they can also demand documents, having previously introduced themselves and explained everything, they can ask for documents and draw up a protocol, then the protocol will be summoned to court.

Yes, that is, they can draw up anything theoretically, but the court has to deal with it and there are many legal loopholes, but it is important to know (it turns out) that it will be punishable. And this is a fine of 3000 soms, but if you are completely rampaging there and set up fights with swearing and disassembling, they can even up to 5 days can be closed in the police department.

Video as not allowed into the hall and illegal detention

<https://drive.google.com/drive/u/7/folders/1jgh-Qv60-EMX6Ci0UOiVN14oRfXv4k9a>

## **Osh had already two loans for electric transportation, why Osh?**

At the same time, the transfer of trolleybuses to Osh is a way to nowhere. There are 30 trolleybuses operating in Osh today, with 23 new trolleybuses only recently received under a loan from the EBRD in 2017-18. Also, about 50-70 new buses are backing up at the trolleybus depot in Osh, and in such conditions it is completely full, accommodating about 80-110 vehicles. If another 100 trolleybuses arrive from Bishkek to Osh, there will be more than 123 trolleybuses, which simply will not fit in the depot. There is only one trolleybus depot in Osh, and there are no plans to build new ones. Today there are two trolleybus routes in Osh, each with 13-15 vehicles per route. There is also an unrealized project of the third route, in case of construction of which the city will need 40-45 trolleybuses to cover all routes, not more. From this we can conclude that Osh does not need 123 trolleybuses, as the city's needs are exhausted by 45 trolleybuses. It turns out that the trolleybuses bought for the money of Bishkek citizens will just stand idle in an unknown place as dead weight and will not be used in any way, although they could work for the benefit of Bishkek, where any transportation is important now. In addition, Osh is also taking an EBRD loan for 20 more new trolleybuses, so the actions to dismantle the trolleybus network in Bishkek and transfer it to Osh are not justified.

<https://www.akchabar.kg/ru/news/dlya-osha-zakupyat-23-trollejbusa-na-kredit-poluchennyj-ot-ebrr>

**2023-2024**

**GrCF2 W2 - Osh Electric Public Transport**

**Project Number : 53522**

**Общая стоимость проекта EUR 23 млн**

<https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/53522.html>



2014 - Osh Public Transport Project (Location: Kyrgyz Republic)

**Project Number:** 44243

Общая стоимость проекта: EUR 9.6 млн.

<https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/osh-public-transport-project.html>

### **More than 60 trolleybuses were replaced by CNG buses with GazProm gas from Russia**

#### **Partly these buses are funded by the EBRD loan.**

Route #4: 13 trolleybuses replaced by 15 buses

Route #5: 17 trolleybuses replaced by 18 buses

Route #8T: 17 trolleybuses replaced by 14 buses

Route #10T: 12 trolleybuses were replaced by 15 buses, initially there were 17

Now appeared Route #17 and 14.

Total: 59 electric trolleybuses were replaced by more than 62 gas buses.

#### **EBRD - GrCF2 W2: Bishkek Buses.** Project number: 51598 <https://www.ebrd.com/work-with-us/projects/psd/51598.html>

The first project under the Bishkek Green Cities Action Plan (GCAP), the initiative is funded by the EBRD's €33 million Community Accounts Package, consisting of a €25 million loan and a Community Investment Grant of up to €8 million. It is supported by a grant of €0.95 million from the Government of Japan.

The EBRD loan will be split into two tranches: Community Tranche I - €16 million and Community Tranche II - €9 million. The project is expected to be co-financed by a large grant of €8 million from the EBRD Shareholder Special Fund (SSF) and/or international donors.

Total project cost: €33,000,000.00

Loan financing: €25,000,000

Grant financing: €8,000,000

The EBRD Bishkek Buses project is expected to improve air quality and reduce greenhouse gas emissions by replacing the current climate-sensitive DIESEL BUSES with low-standard buses in the context of limited natural gas. This project does not involve replacing trolleybuses with gas buses, as is currently the case what is happening with all actives that were for 10 years invested

#### **Replacement of the most environmentally friendly transportation - trolleybus - by electric buses under the project of the Asian Development Bank.**

Now under the project of the Asian Development Bank (ADB) for \$50 million these trolleybuses want to remove and bring electric buses according to the information of the Bishkek City Hall, which violates the agreement with the EBRD and contradicts the ADB project, where only 25 old trolleybuses were to be replaced, not 144.

The Asian Development Bank at our personal meeting with us said that they have nothing to do with this decision. But at the same time, the Bishkek Mayor's Office writes that trolleybuses

should be removed precisely because of electric buses and because they should be transferred to Osh.

At the same time, the city of Osh itself took a loan for \$20 million for trolleybuses, for electric transport on 2 lines. "At the moment in Bishkek dismantled 14 km of trolleybus network, and 1 km is about 45 million soms to build anew. If we take 210km and build the infrastructure anew, the minimum cost is 9.5 billion KGS," Vice-Mayor said.

At the moment 14 km of trolleybus network has already been illegally dismantled and only one third of trolleybuses leave daily. The rest are parked in the depot when the city is experiencing an acute shortage of transportation, especially on the eve of the beginning of the school year. It is very worrying that 50 trolleybus drivers are now unemployed and have been sent on indefinite unpaid leave, thus practically deprived of their earnings, and the liquidation of the trolleybus department means the risk of job loss for 600 people.

On August 22-23, a section of the trolleybus network near Ala-Too Square was dismantled, which was renovated recently, in 2022. Thus, the actions of BTU deprived trolleybuses No. 7 and No. 2 of the possibility of movement. Every day the deputy of the Department of Transportation of the Bishkek City Hall gave different reasons, for example, that the dismantling is taking place within the framework of the BGA project of reconstruction of the Square, to which the Bishkek GlavArchitecture said that this section is not even included in their project.

Another day reported that the dismantling was due to the creation of a "Green Corridor" under a loan to the Asian Development Bank (ADB), but the Bank's urban development representatives said that "ADB did not receive any instructions from the city that the trolleybus would not continue to run on Kievskaya Street. In fact, our Kievskaya Street green corridor project fully includes a contact network for the trolleybus."

Replacement of environmentally friendly carbon-free trolleybuses with gas-powered buses is an unacceptable measure that contradicts existing air pollution control programs. Residents request that the trolleybuses be retained and that trolleybus routes #3, 4, 6, 7, 10, 11, and subsequently #2 and #5 be restored to service

### **Costs of the trolleybus system**

According to preliminary estimates, if the wires are handed over for scrap metal, it will be \$ 1.2 million or more ( $700 \text{ s / kg} * 210 \text{ km}$  of contact network). At the trial, representatives of the Bishkek City Hall began to claim that the wires will not be transferred to Osh, then why remove them? Where are they planned to write them off? The write-off should also be done by the commission, this must be checked.

The construction of one substation costs about \$ 1 million with construction and all the necessary equipment. In our city, there are 19 substations supplying current to the entire system, they are sometimes located in the central parts of the city. Why, with such a high cost of substations, in the documents on the transfer, their cost is not estimated at \$ 1 million, but the cost is indicated as 0 som for 9 substations!

At the court hearing, representatives of the City Hall also presented documents for dismantling only along Baytik Baatyr Street, but they are being removed throughout the city.



To eliminate corruption risks, immediately stop dismantling trolleybus lines, create a commission, demand a full audit from the Accounts Chamber and the Prosecutor's Office.

The Accounts Chamber of the Kyrgyz Republic gave a formal reply saying that there will be an audit and the report will be available on the website, but the report does not contain anything about trolleybuses and it is for 2023.

### **Trolleybuses are jobs!**

At the beginning of last year, more than 600 people worked at the MP "BTU", but at the moment many employees from the trolleybus department are on unpaid leave, and 21 employees of the energy sector were laid off in one day, which also contradicts the Labor Law of the Kyrgyz Republic.

21 people from the energy sector must be reinstated - they worked at electrical substations, there is still voltage there and strategic objects under voltage cannot be left without specialists. Now they have appointed guards, but they do not have the appropriate qualifications and access to substations. Some have worked there for 30-45 years at substations, have higher or technical education and the appropriate documents for working with electrical equipment.

The director himself said in the summer that no one would be fired, but he himself created an order in November on layoffs. At the same time, the HR department has not yet shown the basis for the layoffs when employees asked for a document.

Many are currently on unpaid leave, which deprives workers of their livelihood and is illegal. According to Article 133 of the Labor Code of the Kyrgyz Republic, employees can take unpaid leave only on their own initiative, and not at the request of the employer. "It should be noted that the employer does not have the right to send an employee on unpaid leave on their own initiative." Trolleybus drivers themselves pay for retraining; they should have had the cost of retraining refunded. Employees should be paid 70 percent of their wages for downtime.

Why should the city lose highly qualified personnel with extensive work experience? How much money was spent on their education and training? This is 600 jobs - an opportunity to provide income for 600 citizens of Kyrgyzstan, it is so difficult to create jobs, and why is there no responsibility for their fate?

The director of the MP "BTC" Kaparov is also the director of the bus department and works half a day there and there. It would be better if he completely focused on buses, where accidents occur almost every day and bus service needs to be improved, and a different director is needed in the trolleybus department.

### **People with disabilities and the social role of trolleybuses**

This is not only the most environmentally friendly, but also the most socially important transport in Bishkek, about 20 preferential categories of citizens, for whom the city administration pays

subsidies - these are social guarantees and support for the mobility of pensioners, people with disabilities, etc. Here are some comments from a group of people with disabilities about trolleybuses:

Since trolleybuses were removed for pensioners, for people with disabilities, it is difficult to go anywhere. Since not all buses have ramps, even if there are, not everyone takes it down. Paying for travel is also not always affordable. And not all pensioners and people with disabilities can use the red discount card. To have a Tulpar discount card, you must have a city residence permit, which not everyone has... Also, a trolleybus can hold many more people than buses and routes. I also think that trolleybuses are one of the attractions of our city. And most importantly, trolleybuses do not stink of fuel

Yes, this situation is very bitter and unpleasant. Who was bothered by trolleybuses? It's as if part of their lives were cut out and thrown into the trash. This is environmentally friendly transport. And where are they now? Breaking is not building. We'll live and see...

All relatives, friends, neighbors - everyone is indignant, surprised by this unreasonable, stupid decision. And the saddest thing is that this is being decided by people who do not think about the past and the future. They apparently have no idea that this is history ... And somewhere trams are running and no one has removed them.


### **Bishkek was in the top 20 largest trolleybus systems in the world!**

Development of the trolleybus network is an opportunity to reduce air pollution. Last year, Almaty celebrated the 80th anniversary of the trolleybus, purchased completely new trolleybuses and updated the trolleybus contact network.

Electric transport in the city is a prospect for the development of transport infrastructure and the attraction of Climate financing, since such programs as the EBRD Green Cities Action Plan, Climate and Transport in Central Asia - an ADB project, etc. have already been launched.

If we remove it now, we will never return to this point.



Sector & Reference: Urban Transport UT03 											
<b>Action Title</b>	The renewal of urban passenger transport, through the purchase of electric vehicles, the creation of preferential conditions for their purchase, the creation of a network of charging stations for electric vehicles and the creation of a municipal "Green Taxi".					<b>Action classification</b>		High priority			
						<b>Environmental area</b>		Air, green space			
<b>Action's link to the strategic objectives</b>			SG1: Improve air quality in Bishkek and reduce the negative impact of air pollution on citizens' health while maintaining sustainable growth and improving infrastructure for transport, energy, and waste management.								
<b>Estimated costs: CAPEX</b>		EUR	58,500,000	KGS	5,616,000,000	<b>Annual OPEX</b>		EUR	1,308,000	KGS	125,568,000
<b>Financing mechanisms</b>		International credit funds, city budget, republican budget, public-private partnership.									
<b>Description of the Action:</b>											

[https://ebrdgrecities.com/assets/Uploads/PDF/20240628-GCAP-Bishkek\\_final\\_eng.pdf](https://ebrdgrecities.com/assets/Uploads/PDF/20240628-GCAP-Bishkek_final_eng.pdf)

**Description of the Action:** Electrification of urban transportation is one of the effective measures to reduce environmental impact and improve air quality. By enhancing air quality through the reduction of transportation-related harmful exhaust gases and transitioning public and municipal transportation to environmentally friendly alternatives, emissions of pollutants and greenhouse gases will be minimised. This, in turn, will enhance the health and well-being of the residents of Bishkek. 1. In the period from 2011 to 2018, two phases of the "Development of Public Transport" project were implemented, which was funded by the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development. The budget of the first phase of the project was US \$15.6 million, and the second phase – EUR 7.9 million. 79 trolleybuses were purchased as part of the first phase, 52 trolleybuses were purchased as part of the second phase. The route lines were also modified, and a maintenance centre was equipped. In accordance with the third phase of the project "Improvement of trolleybus infrastructure in Bishkek", the trolleybus infrastructure will be updated: purchase of additional 100 trolleybus units. - partial reconstruction of the existing 19 traction substations. - replacement of cables of contact networks for trolleybuses (with a total length of 100 km); - purchase of contact network supports (in the amount of 200 units); - modernisation of the AC input system – 7 pcs.; - purchase of transformer distribution cells for own needs with transformers – 2 pcs.;

- replacement of traction transformers 6 kV, 1330 kVA – 2 pcs.; - purchase of equipment for power supply of own needs of substations – 3 pcs.; - installation kit – 1 pc., as well as other equipment. The proposed measure aimed at modernising the public transport fleet through the "expansion of electric public transport" – the use of battery-powered trolleybuses and trolleybuses ("on the move" or "dynamic" charging), as well as parks of electric buses (buses and minibuses) and parks of environmentally friendly buses running on compressed natural gas to support the development of public transport. An integrated, safe, and accessible transport system will have a positive impact on the environment and lead to a reduction in air pollution. Along with measures to modernise the trolleybus infrastructure, an assessment of the electricity demand for the trolleybus contacts network/trolleybus substations and charging infrastructure will be carried out. This type of transport has further economic and environmental advantages, since the cost of electricity is lower compared to diesel fuel and gasoline per unit of energy. As part of the third phase of the project, entitled "Improvement of trolleybus infrastructure in Bishkek", the possibility of obtaining a loan from the European Bank for Reconstruction and Development (EBRD) is currently being studied. The total cost of the project is EUR 35 million.

Steps in implementation: Step 1; Renewal of the trolleybus fleet and infrastructure as part of the implementation of project activities of the 3rd phase of the project "Improvement of trolleybus infrastructure in Bishkek". Step 2: introduction of the "green passport" of motor transport after the adoption of the draft law by the Parliament of the Kyrgyz Republic. Step 3: adoption by Parliament and Bishkek City Council of a regulatory act on the creation of a municipal taxi, determination of the source of funding, organisational measures, and implementation of planned measures.

Description of actions: Increased use of vehicles in the city leads to a rising demand for parking spaces. To create conditions for restricting car access to the city centre, an intermediate parking infrastructure will be created for parking vehicles heading to the city centre. The municipality will create a condition under which driving a private car to the city centre will not only be difficult, but also costly, since it will be necessary to pay for entry to the central parts of cities. Of course,

parking in the city will be paid, with the exception of ambulance transport, fire, police, etc. Parking fees will depend on the specific area (centre or outskirts), day of the week, and time of day. The parking system being created will work in close cooperation with the work of public transport (ecological buses and trolleybuses). This will require strengthening the operation to provide timely service to passengers who transfer to urban passenger eco-friendly transport. In addition, the creation of parking infrastructure at the borders of the city limits in the north-south and west-east directions, by creating intercepting parking lots at the entrance to the city, will create a kind of ring aimed at reducing traffic flows to the city of Bishkek, making it unprofitable and expensive for non-resident vehicles to enter, and park them on city territories. The city authorities are already planning projects for the creation of bicycle and pedestrian infrastructure looped both along the outer border areas of the city, and in the city centre. The city authorities are actively working on dedicated lanes for public transport. These lanes prohibit traffic on them other than public transport and this is a barrier to illegal parking along the route of public transport. These projects to create parking and cycling and pedestrian looped infrastructure will need to be connected and mutually complement each other in a promising way. The created parking system will be more focused on improving efficiency and effectiveness public transport operations (buses and trolleybuses). However, the implementation of such plans requires an intermediate stage, which is planned to be implemented by this project. The city authorities are actively working on dedicated lanes for public transport. These lanes serve as a kind of limiter for illegal parking along the public transport route. In some cases, parked cars interfere with the organisation of more bike paths (electric scooters). The introduction of an automated paid parking system is strategically important and is designed to change the existing system flow of vehicles, by restricting entry not only to the central part of the city, but also to the city itself from the border and other regions, thereby optimising traffic flow, and reducing traffic congestion. This will improve the quality and well-being of Bishkek residents, as well as facilitating automated payments that will feed the municipal budget. The main result of this project will be solving environmental problems, reducing harmful emissions into the atmosphere, improving the health of citizens by transferring to bicycles and electric scooters to move around the city centre, a improving health by walking along pedestrian paths, as well as improving passenger communication by eco-friendly types of transport (buses, trolleybuses) The parking system will be more focused on improving the efficiency and effectiveness public transport operations (buses and trolleybuses). The city authorities will also benefit from introducing new mechanisms for introducing fees for the use of road infrastructure (while rationalising the tax burden on carriers), as additional effective sources of financing will be created for the construction, repair and maintenance of road and street-road networks, which, in turn, will significantly improve the quality of transport services and at least solve congestion and maintain their operational qualities. At the same time, mechanisms and measures will be introduced to regulate transport demand, redistribute it in favour of eco-friendly public transport, and reduce the generation of additional demand for individual transport –by improving urban planning and land use policies. A multifunctional paid parking management system will be supported by software for integration with users' mobile devices and third-party information services. The monitoring system will solve the tasks of digitizing the road network. It will be applied by cities and authorised state services. This smart system will be capable to record 25 types of traffic violations. Taking into account the technological capabilities of the camera (360-degree view with a monitoring radius of 200 meters), it will become an effective means of combating prohibited parking "second row" on lawns, sidewalks and public transport stops. The analytical system of the parking space.

## 9.2 Appendix 2. City Emissions Trajectories Tool

Bishkek key results	
Assigned Paris aligned trajectory typology	<b>Late peak</b>
City emissions in 2019	<b>2.9 tCO<sub>2</sub>e/capita</b>
Business-as-usual emissions in 2050	<b>8.8 tCO<sub>2</sub>e/capita</b>
Annual emissions reduction against BAU in 2030 required according to assigned Paris-aligned trajectory	<b>31%</b>
Proportion of assigned Paris-aligned cumulative emissions reductions delivered by GCAP	<b>#V</b>
GCAP actions savings against BAU in 2050	<b>#V</b>
<b>Impact on results from testing alternative decarbonisation trajectory</b>	
Annual emissions reduction against BAU in 2030 required according to assigned Late peak trajectory	<b>#V</b>
Proportion of assigned Paris-aligned cumulative emissions reductions delivered by GCAP	<b>31%</b>
Proportion of Late peak trajectory cumulative emissions reductions delivered by GCAP	<b>#VA</b>

Table 10. City Emissions Trajectories Tool

